

**Design Review and Historic Preservation Board
Minutes
May 14, 2020**

PRESENT

Dirk Schneider, Chairman; Leticia Fornataro John Mitchell, David Wigg, Paul Whitbeck, Bonnie Salem Kathleen Cristman;

ALSO PRESENT

Mark Lenzi, Building Inspector; Allen Reitz, Assistant Building Inspector; Susan Donnelly, Secretary to the Board; Robert Koegel, Town Attorney; Kevin Beckford, Town Board Liaison

Proceedings of a regular meeting of the Pittsford Design Review and Historic Preservation Board were held on Thursday, May 14 at 6:00 P.M. local time. The meeting took place with Board members and applicants participating remotely using Zoom.

Dirk Schneider opened the meeting at 6:00 pm.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION DISCUSSION

Dirk Schneider discussed that the Historic Preservation reception scheduled for May has been postponed. A date in the fall may be determined for a reschedule.

Bonnie Salem noted that the banners have been approved so now the vendor can be contacted to place the order. Discussion was held as to the installation of the banners as to whether this time is a good time to install due to less traffic or if it would be taxing the Town Highway staff at a time when they are particularly busy in light of the COVID-19 pandemic. The decision was made that the banner project should go on but at a date to be determined.

RESIDENTIAL APPLICATION FOR REVIEW

• **23 Shire Oaks Drive**

The Applicant is requesting design review for a living room, bathroom, mudroom and porch addition. The living room and bathroom additions will be located to the rear of the home and the mudroom and porch additions will be located on the front of the home. The submitted plot plan shows the front setback as 57' and the small front porch is drawn over the setback. However, the actual setback is 50' making the front porch in compliance with code.

Steve Palmieri, architect for the project, spoke on behalf of the homeowner, Jakes Oukes.

Mr. Palmieri detailed the many changes to the home. The Board had questions about the porch and some Board members were divided as to whether the segmented arch was a compliment to the design.

Bonnie Salem had questions about the skylights being visible. Mr. Palmieri indicated that the skylights were to provide more light to the kitchen area because an existing window is being removed. Dirk Schneider discussed how given the pitch of the roof the skylights should only be noticeable at night when the lights are on.

Paul Whitbeck moved to accept the application as submitted.

John Mitchell seconded.

Dirk Schneider called for a roll call vote.

Schneider voted aye

Salem voted aye

Fornataro voted aye

Mitchell voted aye

Wigg voted aye

Whitbeck voted aye

Cristman voted aye

- **143 Kilbourn Road**

The Applicant is requesting design review for the addition of a garage and living space. The addition will be approximately 2081 Sq. Ft. and will be located to the rear of the current home.

James Fahy, architect for the project and David Riedman, homeowner of 143 Kilbourn Road discussed the project with the Board. Mr. Fahy outlined the project which will provide more living space to the rear of the home but respect the current street scape. He indicated that there will be CertainTeed shingles, siding and shakes of new materials will be more durable. All the current stone will remain except the stone that needs to be removed for the addition and those materials will be reused. The color scheme will be Benjamin Moore paint colors of Manchester tan and pure white. The windows will be casement with divided lites similar to the current muntin pattern on the current windows. Any replacement stone will be quarried granite to match the existing.

Bonnie Salem alerted the Board that this home is an inventoried structure and relayed that the Board should weigh any changes against the standards for a Certificate of Appropriateness. She felt the changes are good but not original materials and could defeat the purposes for historic preservation in the future.

Mr. Riedman indicated that the current windows are not energy efficient and Mr. Fahy stated the windows are not in good repair but are mostly casement windows and they will be replaced with casement windows. Dirk Schneider supported the proposed windows as a superior choice.

Leticia Fornataro noted a discrepancy of the square footage and this was corrected to reflect approximately 3900 sq. ft. of living space which does not include the garage and porches. Paul Whitbeck asked if the current garage would be demolished and Mr. Fahy indicated that it would.

Mr. Fahy indicated that the copper roof depicted in the renderings on the front porch will be changed to a shingle roof.

A discussion was held about the shutters and the front entrance. The shutters will be replaced due to the owners distaste for them. They will be replaced with two panel flat Atlantic Premium Brand shutters. Dirk Schneider supported this as a good replica of the current. The change to the front entrance according to Mr. Fahy will provide more focus on the entrance and better cover and he feels it will fit in more appropriately with the rest of the architecture of the home.

Dirk Schneider moved to accept the application as submitted with the following conditions:

1. The front porch roofing will be shingles.
2. The updated shutters will be two paneled not louvered.
3. The current stone will be retained with the exception of where it needs to be removed for the addition.
4. The windows will be casement with small divided lites.
5. The two windows by the south entry will be retained.

John Mitchell seconded.

Dirk Schneider called for a roll call vote.

Schenider voted aye
Salem voted aye
Fornataro voted aye
Mitchell voted aye
Wigg voted aye
Whitbeck voted aye
Cristman voted aye

- **307 Tobey Road**

The Applicant is requesting design review for the addition of a master bedroom/bathroom/sun porch. The addition will be approximately 607 Sq. Ft. and will be located to the rear of the home.

Budd Knapp, the architect for the project, was in attendance to discuss the application with the Board.

Leticia Fornataro disclosed that she has worked with the applicant and asked if she needed to recuse herself. Robert Koegel indicated that if she could render a fair and impartial she could vote. Leticia indicated that she could and Mr. Koegel indicated it was appropriate for her to proceed.

Mr. Knapp discussed the various elements of the project which is being constructed to accommodate a family member.

Bonnie Salem moved to accept the application as submitted.

Kathleen Cristman seconded.

Dirk Schneider called for a roll call vote.

Schneider voted aye
Salem voted aye
Wigg voted aye
Whitbeck voted aye
Fornataro voted aye
Cristman voted aye
Mitchell voted aye

- **83 Stoneleigh Court**

The Applicant is requesting design review for the addition of a garage. The current garage will be turned into livable space and a new garage will be added. The approximate square footage will be 759 sq. ft.

Richard Garrett, the contractor, was in attendance to represent the homeowner, James Garrett. Lorie Boehlert logged on to the meeting but did not comment.

Paul Whitbeck indicated that he is acquainted with the applicant and Robert Koegel indicated that as long as Mr. Whitbeck could offer a fair and unbiased vote it was appropriate to proceed.

Mr. Garrett discussed the project as turning an existing garage into a family room and the construction of a new two car garage. A dormer will be added to tie in with the architecture of the home. He indicated all materials will match the existing home. The existing garage door will be reused. The pitch of the garage will reflect the same pitch as the home.

John Mitchell moved to accept the application as submitted.

Leticia Fornataro seconded.

Dirk Schneider called for a roll call of the Board.

Schenider voted aye
Salem voted aye
Fornataro voted aye
Mitchell voted aye
Wigg voted aye
Whitbeck voted aye
Cristman voted aye

- **440 Canfield Road**

The Applicant is requesting design review for the construction of a horse barn and indoor riding area. The total square footage of the structure will be approximately 10,040 square feet. No zoning review is required.

The homeowner, Joel Cohen, was in attendance to discuss the application.

Mr. Cohen detailed the project of the construction of a horse barn. The barn will be located behind the residence and more than 100 feet from Canfield Road. All materials (color and trim) will match the home and an out building on the property. The residence is vinyl sided but the barn will be metal siding.

The structure will not be visible from the NYS Thruway.

Kathleen Cristman moved to accept the application as submitted.

Dirk Schneider seconded.

Dirk Schneider called for a roll call vote.

Schneider voted aye
Salem voted aye
Wigg voted aye
Whitbeck voted aye
Fornataro voted aye
Cristman voted aye
Mitchell voted aye

RESIDENTIAL APPLICATION FOR REVIEW – NEW HOMES

- **2 Ravenna Crescent**

The Applicant is requesting design review for the construction of a two story single family home. The home's first floor will be 1504 Sq. Ft. and there will be 1488 Sq. Ft. on the second floor. The home will be located in the Coventry Ridge Subdivision.

Jim Connaughton of Coventry Ridge Corporation was in attendance to speak with the Board regarding this application.

Mr. Connaughton mentioned that this home backs to a 20 foot hill.

The Board members, Kathleen Cristman and Bonnie Salem, complimented the use of only two materials on the home and the simple classic design.

David Wigg moved to accept the application as submitted.

Leticia Fornataro seconded.

Dirk Schneider called for a roll call.

Schneider voted aye
Salem voted aye
Wigg voted aye
Whitbeck voted aye
Fornataro voted aye
Cristman voted aye
Mitchell voted aye

- **28 Escena Rise**

The Applicant is requesting design review for the construction of a two story single family home. The home will be approximately 1509 Sq. Ft. on the first floor and 1776 Sq. Ft. on the second floor. This home will be located in the Wilshire Hills Subdivision.

Jeff Brokaw of Morrell Builders was in attendance to discuss this application with the Board.

The Board discussed multiple reservations regarding the design of this home.

1. The disproportionate appearance of the raised shed roof on the front door entry and the busy appearance of the arched entry.
2. The trim above the door not lining up with the trim of the windows on the front elevation.
3. Excessive similarity to the designs to other homes nearby.
4. The lack of the presentation of a color scheme for this model.
5. Excessive massing on the side elevation.

Although the Board stated that while it is not their role to redesign the home, suggestions were made as to how it might be altered to improve the overall appearance. A structure at 24 Escena Rise was reviewed as a similar design already approved but the Board determined that this residence entry was wider and presented a softer

appearance. Color choices could have had some bearing on the concerns regarding excessive similarity but Mr. Brokaw could not provide that information.

The Board discussed denying the application or holding this application over until updated drawings and a color scheme could be presented. Robert Koegel discussed the processes of holding over an application versus denying an application and any subsequent appeal regarding a denial. Furthermore, the Board discussed the value of having the Architect attend to present to discuss potential design changes and to review the Town's Design Review guidelines to avoid further concerns or denials in future designs.

Jeff Brokaw cited the customer preferences and any additional expense to the customer as reasons to not implement these changes. He strenuously expressed his desire to move forward with this project due to the construction delays imposed by New York State during the COVID-19 pause on work.

Further discussion ensued to determine under what conditions this design would be deemed acceptable to the Board to be in keeping with the Town's design guidelines.

David Wigg moved to accept the application as submitted with conditions:

1. The color chosen for the siding will not be the same color hue as 24 Escena Rise; but complementary to it.
2. The cedar shake on the gable will be not be added as in the renderings.
3. Trim shall be added above the door to duplicate the arch and remove excessive siding lines.

Dirk Schneider seconded.

Dirk Schneider called for a roll vote.

Schenider voted aye
Salem voted aye
Fornataro voted aye
Mitchell voted aye
Wigg voted aye
Whitbeck voted aye
Cristman voted aye

- **15 Blackwood Circle**

The Applicant is requesting design review for the construction of a one story single family home. The home will be approximately 2000 Sq. Ft. and will be located in the Wilshire Hills Subdivision.

Jeff Brokaw of Morrell Builders discussed this application with the Board.

The trim above the door on the front elevation and the sparse elevation on the left side elevation were discussed.

Regarding the front elevation, the Board asked that the trim above the door be raised to line up with adjacent windows. It was noted that this is not quite as disproportionate as the application for 28 Escena Rise but the trim would improve the appearance. Jeff Brokaw indicated that he could easily do this.

It was also noted that the left side elevation is sparse and the Board asked if anything could be done to improve the appearance and mitigate the massing. Jeff Brokaw indicated he would be willing to case all of the windows on the home to match.

Dirk Schneider moved to approve the application with the following conditions:

1. The trim over the front door be raised to match the top of the window trim on the windows adjacent to the front door.
2. An additional window will be added on the left hand elevation at the garage location.
3. All windows on the home will be cased to match the windows on the front side elevation.

Bonnie Salem seconded.

Dirk Schneider called for a roll call vote.

Schneider voted aye

Salem voted aye
Wigg voted aye
Whitbeck voted aye
Fornataro voted aye
Cristman voted aye
Mitchell voted aye

INFORMAL REVIEW

- **2534 Clover Street**

The Applicant has applied for a demolition permit for a garage in accordance with Chapter 64 Article VIII §64-43 B of the Pittsford Town Code. This property is Zoned Residential Neighborhood (RN). Said structure is over 50 years old.

Dave Wigg discussed the structure to be demolished as he had knowledge of the proposed project. Robert Koegel verified that this would be appropriate since the discussion is only informal and there will be no vote taken this evening.

Dave discussed that the structure was leaning and in "rough shape". He did not feel that the garage was a significant structure with "no redeeming qualities". John Mitchell and Dirk Schneider expressed that they had no reservations about the demolition of this structure.

OTHER

Mark Lenzi indicated that there is a plan for the next Design Review and Historic Preservation meeting to proceed on Thursday, May 28 via a Zoom meeting.

Dirk Schneider indicated he would not be available for the meeting on the 28th.

REVIEW OF 3/12/2020 MINUTES

Bonnie Salem moved to approve the minutes of the March 12, 2020 meeting as submitted with a correction.

Dirk Schneider seconded.

All Ayes.

The meeting adjourned at 9:00 pm.

Respectfully submitted,

Susan Donnelly
Secretary to the Board