

**Design Review and Historic Preservation Board
Minutes
January 23, 2020**

PRESENT

Dirk Schneider, Chairman; Paul Whitbeck, Bonnie Salem, Kathleen Cristman, John Mitchell, David Wigg

ALSO PRESENT

Mark Lenzi, Building Inspector; Susan Donnelly, Secretary to the Board; Robert Koegel, Town Attorney

ABSENT

Leticia Fornataro

Dirk Schneider opened the meeting at 6:45 pm.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION DISCUSSION

Dirk Schneider announced to the Board that Kevin Beckford, Town Councilman will be the new liaison to the Design Review and Historic Preservation Board replacing Stephanie Townsend.

A date of May 21 was announced for the reception for the homeowners of inventoried homes. Bonnie Salem updated last year's invitation letter and requested feedback from the Board. Letters will be sent out mid-April. Kathleen Cristman volunteered to do the refreshments. Town staff will locate nametags and procure the slide show. Dirk Schneider will serve as host. Owners of designated homes will also be invited. The Board will work on locating a speaker to present on a topic that will be relevant to all the homeowners.

LANDMARK DESIGNATION

• **201 Long Meadow Circle**

The Applicant is requesting design review to designate the above address as a Historic Landmark in accordance with Article XXX, Section 185-195.3 of the Pittsford Town Code.

Dirk Schneider opened the Public Hearing.

Doreen Smethurst, the homeowner, was present.

Bonnie Salem recommended this property for Landmark Designation. She cited this home as rated G+ by the recent Bero report and how it met the standards for landmark designation in the following ways:

1. The property is connected with historic personage as it is located on Long Meadow Circle an area which was designed by noted landscape architect Alling DeForest.
2. The home was built in 1912 and has maintained much of its original integrity of the architecture undergoing little change over the years.
3. This home was recommended for landmark designation in the most recent updating of the Bero Report.
4. This home has distinguishing architectural characteristics of Craftsman design.

It was discussed that the original garage was demolished in 1964 and replaced and the current structure is not significant enough to be included in the designation. The parcel surrounding the home is included in the designation in order to avoid undue encroachment on the structure.

There was no public comment.

Bonnie Salem moved to close the Public Hearing and Paul Whitbeck seconded.

All Ayes.

Bonnie Salem noted that the homeowner was very helpful in the preparation of the landmark designation.

Kathleen Cristman lent her support to the designation and also noted that this property has sustained very little change over the years.

A resolution was moved by Board member Bonnie Salem, seconded by Board member Kathleen Cristman and was voted upon by members of the Board as follows:

Dirk Schneider	Aye
David Wigg	Aye
Bonnie Salem	Aye
Kathleen Cristman	Aye
Leticia Fornataro	Absent
Paul Whitbeck	Aye
John Mitchell	Aye

The structure and surrounding property with the exclusion of the detached garage were granted Landmark Designation 2020-01.

RESIDENTIAL APPLICATION FOR REVIEW – NEW HOME

- **9 Lexton Way**

The Applicant is requesting design review for the construction of a single-family one story home. The home will be approximately 2118 sq. ft. and will be located in the Wilshire Hill Subdivision.

Jeff Brokaw of Morrell Builders was present.

Mr. Brokaw had recently submitted a new drawing that indicated a change in the orientation of the home on the lot. He referenced that this change is so the owners do not look into other backyards as drawn in the original submission.

John Mitchell moved to approve the application with the resubmission of the drawing on 1/22/2020 with the new orientation. Dirk Schneider seconded.

All Ayes.

COMMERCIAL APPLICATION FOR REVIEW

- **3240 Monroe Avenue – Jos. A Bank Sign**

The Applicant is requesting design review for the replacement of a business identification sign. The sign will be approximately 64.5 sq. ft. and will identify "Jos.A.Bank". The sign will be reverse lit (halo) channel white letters and the store windows will be framed in gold. The business identification sign at the front of the plaza will also change to reflect the new design.

Laura Barnes of Premier Sign Systems was present. She discussed the removal of an old sign "Jos. Bank Clothiers" will be replaced with a halo lit "Jos. A. Bank" sign.

The Board approved of the new design. It was noted that two shields will be added to the columns in front of the store and the directory sign will also change and these will be included in the approval only.

Kathleen Cristman moved to approve the sign above the store arch, column shields and directory change. Any other notes on the plans are not included in this approval.

Dirk Schneider seconded.

All Ayes.

INFORMAL REVIEW – DEMOLITION AND NEW BUILD

- **123 Sunset Boulevard**

The Applicant is requesting an informal review for the construction of a new two story home. The home will be approximately 5000 sq. ft. and will replace the current home at the above address. The Applicant will have to apply for a demolition permit.

Jon Schick, the architect for the project, was present.

Mr. Schick discussed the homeowners purchased this property as they wished to have a home in walking distance of the Village of Pittsford. They are moving from the United Kingdom and wish to include a guest suite for visiting family as well as ample room for their family of 3 children.

Mr. Schick indicated that the home will be much larger than the current modest Cape Cod structure that currently stands. The proposed structure just meets the setback requirements for a structure on this property. A garage forward with courtyard design is proposed with several gables. He discussed a front porch to be recessed under the gables would be added to the design that is not reflected in the initial rendering. He said that no materials have yet been chosen but the clients are favoring cultured stone and mini clapboard. Samples of the clients preferred designs were presented to the Board by Mr. Schick.

Board members discussed their observations and concerns:

1. Bonnie Salem – is concerned with the size of this house not being in character with the rest of the neighborhood and is too big for the lot. She noted that this would be the largest house on the street. The next largest home is 3000 sq. ft. on $\frac{3}{4}$ of an acre. She noted that many trees in this area are deciduous making this home fully visible for a portion of the year. In short, she feels the proposed structure does not meet the massing guidelines.
2. Kathleen Cristman stated she is disappointed that a desirable house in this neighborhood is proposed to be demolished. She has concerns about the massing. She feels that simplicity in design and materials is key to making this design work in the neighborhood. She would not approve of anything of multiple materials or heavy stone. She feels that screening of this large dwelling would be key.
3. John Mitchell asked questions about the setback and it was determined that the proposed structure just fits the setback and no variances are needed. Mr. Mitchell agreed with Kathleen about the materials and agreed that he could not support heavy materials on the structure. He stated that simplicity of design could potentially mitigate the large design. However, a smaller classic house is more desirable.
4. David Wigg noted that the house fits just within the setback. Would it be possible to stretch the house to the back? Could ceiling heights and gables be brought down so the house is not so imposing?
5. Paul Whitbeck agreed with Bonnie Salem's remarks and expressed his concerns about tearing down the present house and that the proposed home will not fit into the neighborhood. He is concerned the Board will not approve what the homeowner wants and they may make

concessions in order to build and then consequently not end up with the home they envisioned.

6. Dirk Schneider is concerned about the neighbor to the back yard of the proposed home. He requests information to tell the story of how this structure will not encroach on the neighbor to the west.

The architect addressed the concerns of the Board and expressed his own reservations of the project. He agreed that a more simplistic design would be more appropriate.

Mark Lenzi acknowledged that the scaling of the home is contrary to the guidelines.

Robert Koegel, Town Attorney advised the Board that if the scale of the proposed design is such that it is not in keeping with the neighborhood than the Board has a right to not approve it. He noted that this proposed home is significantly larger than others in the neighborhood. He suggested that the Board bring up points that would mitigate how the house will not look so big in the neighborhood to provide that to the architect and homeowner and/or if they have serious misgivings than they should communicate that.

The Board was asked to recap for the architect and client their main concerns:

1. The massing of the home is inappropriate for this neighborhood. Board members stated the design needs to be reduced in square footage by “a lot”.
2. The height of the home. What can be done to minimize the appearance of the height of the structure? Can the gables be lowered?
3. Simplicity of design and materials would be important to fitting into this neighborhood.
4. The Board would like to see a re-design in another informal review before the current house is demolished.

OTHER – REVIEW OF 1/9/2020 MINUTES

Dirk Schneider moved to approve the minutes of the 1/9/20 meeting. Kathleen Cristman seconded.

All Ayes.

The meeting adjourned at 8:55 pm.

Respectfully submitted,

Susan Donnelly
Secretary to the Board